

APPENDIX 1

SHRUB PLACE, PILRIG: REVISED STATEMENT OF URBAN DESIGN PRINCIPLES

Site Location and Description (Figure1)

- 1 Pilrig lies to the north east of the city centre and is a densely developed area of tenemental houses and commercial uses, fragmented by busy roads and operational railway lines. The significance of the area for industry has diminished in recent years and there has been a steady loss of industrial and commercial land to other uses, principally mixed use residential and office uses.
- 2 The site consists of the former Lothian Transport bus depot (Listed Category B), a Masonic Hall and Shrubhill House. The former bus depot extends to approximately 1.7 Hectares. It is 280 metres deep but presents a narrow frontage of 44 metres wide to Leith Walk. The Masonic Hall is sandwiched between the industrial buildings and the freight railway on the south-west. Shrubhill House stands to the east, next to Inchkeith Court, a 1960s high-rise block. To the north of these are the two-storey Shaw Colonies (category B listed).
- 3 The site has two street frontages, one to Leith Walk and the other to Dryden Terrace. Dryden Terrace is linked to Dryden Street by a pedestrian bridge over the railway line. The remainder of the site has essentially a backland character with residential to the north and a railwayline to the south.

Policy Context

- 4 The North East Edinburgh Local Plan Proposals Map includes the site within a 'Housing and Compatible Uses' land use designation: a mainly residential in which existing residential character and amenities are to be safeguarded
- 5 The most relevant policies of the Plan are those concerned with the provision of affordable housing and the design and quality of new development. Policy H5a requires sets out the requirements for affordable housing in North East Edinburgh: requiring 25% of new residential units to be 'affordable' in the Broughton Ward, where development of 25 units or more is proposed, Paragraphs 4.21a and 4.21b contain a reasoned justification for this requirement.
- 6 The Plan also contains policy statements on: the design and quality of new housing; the built heritage; listed buildings; landscape quality and open space provision. There are also retail and transportation policies of relevance to the redevelopment of the site. Of particular relevance are policies E25, which requires new development to integrate carefully with its surroundings as regards its scale, form, siting, alignment and use of materials, E26, which requires new development to make a positive contribution to overall quality of the environment and E22, which requires new development in conservation areas to take account of the area's special interest and how its character and appearance may be preserved or enhanced. Policy E18 considers the effect of new development on listed buildings, including their settings.

Finally, Policy H4 requires new housing development to be well laid out and to harmonise with and respect the character of the surrounding residential area.

- 7 Supplementary planning guidance contained in the Council's Development Quality Handbook and Standards for Urban Design is also relevant to the redevelopment of the site. Of particular relevance is guidance on High Buildings and Roofscapes, which requires new development to reflect the pattern of the existing roofscape in the area. The Council's 'Urban Villages' Charter advocates an adequate and appropriate mix of uses in new development - the redevelopment of the nearby "Hopetoun Village" area illustrates the success of this approach, incorporating a mix of uses and development of a human scale.
- 8 The approved Leith Conservation Area Character Appraisal describes its special urban and townscape qualities of the area and identifies the parameters for assessing new development proposals within the conservation area. This stresses the importance of respecting the traditional tenemental character of the area. The traditional tenemental character of Leith Walk is particularly important and new development needs to fit the context and enhance the character.
- 9 It is anticipated that development on the scale envisaged will have a significant impact on the provision of educational, health and other community services in this part of the city. Where constraints exist in the provision of these services to meet the demands of new development, planning permission will only be granted for new development when adequate infrastructure and essential supporting facilities are available, firmly committed or to be provided as part of a scheme. If the provision of such infrastructure or facilities is a necessary part of the development proposal under consideration as a planning application, it will be secured as a condition of approval or by means of a legal agreement entered into at the time of granting planning permission. In this regard reference should be made to supplementary planning guidance on the following issues:
 - Investment in Schools;
 - Movement and Development (Transport);
 - Tram Developer Contributions (August 2004).
- 10 National policies of relevance are set out in SSP1: The Planning System; NPPG 18: Planning and the Historic Environment, Designing Places; Planning Advice Note 67: Housing Quality; Planning Advice Note 68: Design Statements; A Policy on Architecture for Scotland; and the Memorandum of Guidance on Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas, all of which aim to further improve the architectural and urban design quality of new buildings.

Application History

- 11 This site has been the subject of various planning applications and listed building consents proposing mixed use development (CEC Ref. 01/00509/ful, 02/04595/ful, 02/04593/ful & 02/04595/LBC). On 20th July 2004, following a public inquiry, a number of planning application and listed building appeals were dismissed and refused permission (SEIRU Ref: P/PPA/230/488 & 529 & P/LBA/230/121)

- 12 The purpose of the revised Statement of Urban Design Principles is to consider the future development of the site taking into account the evidence presented at the Inquiry, the findings and conclusions of the Reporters that lead to the refusal of planning permission and listed building consent for previous proposals on the site and to strengthen the text accordingly. The objective is to now achieve a quality, mixed use development that not only sits well with its surroundings, but significantly contributes to the character and appearance of the area, including Leith Walk.

Constraints (Figure 2)

- 13 Perhaps the most significant constraint is the multiple ownership within the site. The Lothian Transport bus depot, Shrubhill House and Masonic Halls are all in separate ownership and may not be able to be developed simultaneously. Nevertheless, proposals must not come forward in a fragmented, uncoordinated matter which would undermine the objectives of the brief.
- 14 The former Lothian Transport bus depot site originally opened in 1870 as a tram depot. The site is covered by the listing of the former bus depot, category B listed (Broughton Ward). However, certain buildings and structures have been identified as being of particular historic and architectural interest. These include the early tramway workshops and power station and later brick tram sheds located to the north of the site, adjacent to Dryden Street.
- 15 The oldest buildings were built in 1898 and extended out later, probably in the 1920s. The original buildings are red brick with sandstone bands and have a number of interesting features such as large round arched recessed openings, shaped pediments and clerestory with circular windows. Internally, there is a grand painted brick interior with recesses reading through from the exterior arches and an exposed steel roof construction with a clerestory band.
- 16 The chimney is included in the listing although it was reduced in height around 1975. The later buff brick tram sheds have tripartite concrete gables to the railway and brick gables to the Shaw's Colonies. The brick wall and gables to the east boundary create a clear boundary definition with the Shaw colonies and their incorporation into any redevelopment strategy is also desirable.
- 17 Some demolition may be accepted on the basis that the retained structures will be restored and enhanced. Figure 2 illustrates those components which should be retained and incorporated into any proposed redevelopment. Uses, which enable the most sympathetic reuse of these structures, and avoid extensive internal subdivision, should be sought.
- 18 The southern section of the site, fronting Leith Walk lies within Leith Conservation Area. Shrubhill House is a very prominent building on the Leith Walk frontage. It is a concrete structure with a later metal-clad extension, which detract from the character of the conservation area and the street scene. It currently houses local authority functions and it is anticipated that this building will be vacated and disposed of within the near future. The demolition of this structure is supported.

- 19 The Masonic Hall, lying to the west of the site, is a low-rise building of no architectural distinction but which occupies a significant rectangle at the centre of the site. The building has extensive car parking and takes access from Shrub Place. The club has a function hall, which has a capacity of 280 and holds functions most weeks from Thursday to Sunday. There are also a number of smaller bars and meeting rooms on the premises. The extensive car park lies to the south of the hall. This use creates the potential for noise disturbance to future residents from the operation of the club and noise activity in the car park as patrons. It is therefore desirable to redevelop the Masonic Hall as part of a redevelopment of the bus depot and the re-provision of this use within the site should be considered.
- 20 Should this use remain it will clearly have implication for the location, orientation and design of any proposed residential units. The development should address phasing and noise issues.
- 21 The setting of Shaw's Colonies to the east is an important consideration; given their category B listing and their modest scale, and they should guide development adjacent.
- 22 There is a fall of about 5 to 7 metres in level from the railway boundary and from Leith Walk.
- 23 Given the former use of the site contamination is a possibility. In such circumstances the production of a consultants report to ascertain the extent of any contamination and the remediation will be required as a condition of consent.
- 24 Where dwellings face on to the adjacent railway line and/or Leith Walk, there is potential for noise to affect these elements of the development.

Contextual Analysis (illustration 2)

- 25 The site is visible from outwith the area from higher vantage points including Calton Hill and within it, particularly from Leith Walk, where it crosses the railway line. Some glimpses are available in between the tenements along McDonald road. The freight rail line provides a vista along the site from both Leith Walk and Dryden Bridge. It also acts as a green corridor and has biodiversity interest. The railway line offers the potential for a future cycle/pedestrian route should this line cease to be operational.
- 26 The existing industrial buildings form a dominant presence to the environment of the Colonies and terraces nearby. Their roofscape is mixed and provides a varied geometry and intricacy in high and distant city-wide views. The chimney of the listed buildings is visible from many streets in the nearby area. There are also views out from the site to Arthur's Seat.
- 27 Strong structural urban elements relating to the site are: the edge pattern of traditional tenements along Leith Walk and McDonald Road (including its gardens to the rear and the railway line), and the formal layout of the Colonies housing and adjacent terraces. The complex of Listed Buildings contributes to the character of the area creating a unique identity.

- 28 Leith Walk is a main arterial road of generous proportions with mixed uses and intense pedestrian activity. The majority of Leith Walk is a primary or secondary shopping frontage and this role should be strengthened by any proposed redevelopment. The Shrub Place frontage is part of the Conservation Area and therefore requires special consideration. Height, roofscape and materials are important considerations.
- 29 Communal and individual private gardens within the perimeter blocks of traditional tenements and terraces provide green structural elements within the urban grid, and these soften the contrasts of scales and uses.
- 30 Changes of height and mass occur as the urban fabric follows the topography stepping down towards the north and east. At their best, these changes are subtly resolved in the setting and design of the traditional buildings.
- 31 There are existing intrusive elements in the urban structure, notably the Masonic Hall at the core of the site; Shrubhill House fronting Leith Walk; and the tower block of Inchkeith, These structures should not prevent the development of a proposal which seeks to reinforce the positive aspects of the character of the wider area. Their architectural quality nor height should be taken as precedents for future schemes. The setting of the adjacent A listed Middlefield House is an important consideration.
- 32 The Masonic Hall and Shrubhill House are elements on the site that create serious difficulties for the integration of any piecemeal redevelopment. Where these structures remain they must be addressed in any application, in addition proposals must demonstrate how they can fit within a framework for the redevelopment of the entire site.

Conceptual Framework (illustration 3)

- 33 The site presents opportunities for integrating redevelopment into the neighbourhood. The framework seeks to encourage the creation of a sense of place while recognising the existing components within and adjacent to the site.
- 34 The Conceptual Framework considers the site as three different but linked elements. Each of the elements offers different opportunities to respond to constraints and it is a challenge to respond to these constraints and create a cohesive townscape appropriate for this context.

Leith Walk Section

- 35 This section should strengthen the linear edge to Leith Walk and create an appropriately scaled entrance to the site.
- 36 There is an opportunity for mixed uses, developed in a way, which enhances the public realm and local identity. Buildings should generally follow the strong lines of a formal perimeter block arrangement although the potential for a setback public space may offer an alternative solution.
- 37 The traditional tenemental street scene, which separates public from private, so characteristic of and important to the Leith Conservation Area sets the context and will influence profoundly what is acceptable in the form and design of the proposed townscape.

Central Section

- 38 This section should create a clearly defined urban structure, which creates a careful relationship between the varied edge conditions.
- 39 The creation of living streets, incorporating front doors and encouraging on street activity should be an overriding objective of this section.
A clearly legible townscape, which reflects the planned nature of the context, will offer the most successful solution. Development must be sympathetic to the modest scale of the adjacent Shaw colonies while taking no reference from Inchkeith Court.
- 40 This area must form clear physical and visual links with both Leith Walk and the proposed public open space, this could take the form of a sequence of linked spaces or a linear route.
- 41 The existing brick gable wall to the Colonies, if retained, must be sensitively integrated into the new development. For example, there may be opportunities for terraces and town houses, which echo the profile and use of the retained wall in a functional and purposeful way, achieving an interesting roof silhouette and elevation composition. Green areas of private and semi-private gardens should complement public open spaces and help to structure the layout. These areas should be well connected to both Leith Walk and proposed open space. The resulting form should be sensitive to the domestic scale of the Colonies and echo their intimacy, density, and plot width. The conversion of some of the workshops, rather than their redevelopment, is not excluded and has some attraction in terms of sustainability.
- 42 The green edge to the railway should be strengthened and future access facilitated.

Dryden Terrace Section

- 43 This section should enhance the setting of the retained listed buildings and chimney through the formation of a public open space.

- 44 The listed buildings are the focal point of this site and need a generosity of space around them to emphasise their distinct character and identity and provide them with a proper physical setting. There should be a strong element of functional public space to relate the new development with the industrial buildings. A mixed of uses complementing the reuse of the listed buildings and enhancing the proposed public space are highly desirable. New development should complement the historic fabric and create enclosure to the new public space.
- 45 Dryden Terrace, notably the ramp and pedestrian bridge, needs to be improved and integrated with the new scheme. Linkages to Dryden Street, Dryden Terrace, the proposed open space, the north south pedestrian route and the proposed cycle pedestrian route need to be carefully handled to ensure a high quality legible public realm.

Development Principles

General

- 46 The principal concern of the statement is to set out the main planning and design principles on which redevelopment should be based. It identifies infrastructure requirements and opportunities for public realm improvements.
- 47 The Council seeks to achieve a sustainable transformation to a high quality mixed-use development which creates an urban environment of high architectural and design standards; to retain and enhance the physical and natural assets of the area, maximising their contribution to its regeneration and integration into the wider environment; and to ensure that the new environment reflects the needs and aspirations of the local community and contributes to their future well-being. The critical consideration for a new proposal is its relationship to the scale and context of the surroundings; the importance of harmony and integration with the surrounding area.
- 48 Objectives:
- the creation of a sustainable mixed use development which reinforces a sense of place;
 - retention and enhancement of existing historic fabric of merit;
 - enhance role and character of Leith Walk.

Key Components

- 49 The key components required to fulfil these objectives are identified in figure 4:
- Incorporate retained gables to the east as an integral element of the redevelopment. For engineering reasons it is preferred to construct new buildings off these gables. Partial reductions in the height of the wall could be acceptable where appropriate and neighbouring amenity is not compromised.

- Placemaking: Creation of place and harmonious integration into neighbourhood.
- Definition of building line to Leith Walk. The demolition of Shrubhill House is preferred to enable a more appropriate, and comprehensive, redevelopment.
- Planned spatial structure of development, circulation, and landscape which creates a cohesive structure for the entire site. The site contains landscape elements of historic interest, including setts, which should be incorporated.
- Architecture of the highest quality is an essential component. A uniform architectural treatment would create a clear townscape. A varied architectural approach, within a clearly defined townscape structure, could equally provide the opportunity for an imaginative solution.
- The Leith Walk streetscape should create an attractive public realm, which prioritises pedestrian movement.
- Open Space adjacent to Listed Building.
- Legible Pedestrian permeability north-south with linkage to future pedestrian cycle route on railway line.
- Improve public realm and pedestrian/cycle access at Dryden Street bridge.
- Incorporate a mix of uses including employment generating uses. Appropriate uses should be explored which enable the sympathetic reuse of the listed buildings. A predominately retail and service use frontage to Leith Walk should form part of this mix.
- Mix of dwelling type, size and tenure. Where residential use is proposed the central section of the site should incorporate family dwellings with private external space.
- Visual permeability to west boundary to ensure positive edge to future pedestrian cycle route.

50 The design should aim for a high sustainability rating. It should take advantage of natural methods as far as possible to achieve the required standards of daylighting, ventilation, using passive solar gain and high standards of insulation to offer low energy use. A sustainable urban drainage system, including run-off from hard surfaces, should be developed with SEPA and Scottish Water. Materials should be low embodied energy and from sustainable sources. Site waste should be minimised and longer term water and waste reduction should be aimed for.

Massing and Scale

Leith Walk Section

- 51 This section should reflect a traditional four storey tenement height including a heightened ground floor appropriate to a commercial frontage. A traditional roof form envelope should be respected and particular care should be exercised in gable situations. There should be no miniaturisation or inappropriate use of proportion by squashing extra storeys within envelopes similar to those of traditional buildings. The design verticality and expression of traditional plot widths should prevail and find expression in the treatment of elevations.

Central Section

- 52 This section should generally reflect a traditional four storey tenement massing. Expression of traditional plot widths should prevail in the treatment of elevations. Buildings adjacent to the east boundary should be restricted in height to create a sensitive relationship to, and enhance the setting of, the adjacent listed colonies. No reference should be taken from the inappropriate form of Inchkeith House.

Dryden Terrace Section

- 53 Development in this section should not exceed the ridge height of the retained listed buildings. Buildings adjacent the east boundary should be restricted in height to create a sensitive relationship to the adjacent housing. Primary concern will focus on the retention and enhanced setting of the listed buildings to the satisfaction of the Planning Authority and Historic Scotland.

Transportation

- 54 Provision for pedestrians, cyclists and children should be safe, secure, direct and designed to encourage walking and cycling to school in particular. It should be a comprehensive feature of the overall layout, providing a route through the site and connecting where possible to the existing network and future pedestrian/cycle route along the railway line. Where routes are shared, these should be provided at a minimum width of 4m.
- 55 The council proposes to extend the controlled parking zone to McDonald Road. Any development should be designed to enable the careful control of on street commuter and visitor car parking. The topography of the site affords the opportunity to incorporate underbuild or underground car parking, particularly in areas of flatted development. Proposal with extensive surface parking will inevitably incorporate compromised open space and amenity, this will not be acceptable. Given the close proximity to frequent public transport and local amenities a reduced level of car parking could be considered, where additional benefits such as increased amenity provision, are clearly demonstrated. The incorporation of City Car Club spaces, in conjunction with a financial contribution to the operation of the club may also enable a better overall solution.

- 56 The use of underground/underbuild car parking is encouraged as a method of achieving high quality townscape and public realm free from extensive areas of surface car parking. The detailing of this arrangement needs to be carefully considered to ensure that community safety and landscape quality is not compromised.
- 57 Access to all new housing is required to be via roads built to an adoptable standard and designed to 'Home Zone' principles. The proposed layout should be designed to naturally slow vehicular movement without the requirement for obvious traffic calming.

Implementation

- 58 It is imperative that any successful bidder engages in early constructive discussion with the planning authority to enable a development, which meets the objectives of this design statement. In addition, the developer should consult at an early stage with the local community, local community groups and local amenity bodies. Consultation with Historic Scotland is also encouraged.
- 59 It is the Council's preference that the intentions for the area come forward in the form of a single proposal. However, given the multiple land ownership, it is accepted that such an approach may not be possible. Nevertheless, proposals must not come forward in a fragmented uncoordinated manner which would undermine the objectives of the brief. Any application for part of the site will need to demonstrate how the proposed development fits within a Masterplan framework. Preferably there will be a single application for the two principal sites on the Leith Walk frontage. Each site must then demonstrate how it meets the requirements of the Statement without prejudicing neighbouring sites.
- 60 Proposals must be accompanied by a Design Statement, prepared in accordance with Planning Advice Note 68:Design Standards. Statements should explain the philosophy of the design approach and demonstrate that an urban design analysis, illustrating the relationship between the proposal and its context, has been applied and has informed the project both in terms of place making and architecture. Details of all the proposed demolitions and alterations would be a requirement of any Listed Building Consent application. Justification in line with the Memorandum of Guidance must be provided for any proposed demolition of a listed building or structure. A massing model showing the development proposal in context, would be a highly desirable supporting element to the design process and a planning application. Sunlight and Daylight analysis will enable the assessment of any potential impact on neighbouring sites and the proposed environment within the site.
- 61 The Adjusted Statement of Urban Design Principles presents the policy and standards which potential developers need to address in formulating proposals for this site. There is enormous scope within these parameters for imaginative and creative schemes. In meeting this challenge, potential developers must consult with the local community at an early stage in the development of their schemes.